

# Hybrid fuzzy multi-attribute decision making model for evaluation of advanced digital technologies in manufacturing: Industry 4.0 perspective

Medić, N.<sup>a,\*</sup>, Anišić, Z.<sup>a</sup>, Lalić, B.<sup>a</sup>, Marjanović, U.<sup>a</sup>, Brezocnik, M.<sup>b</sup>

<sup>a</sup>University of Novi Sad, Faculty of Technical Sciences, Novi Sad, Serbia

<sup>b</sup>University of Maribor, Faculty of Mechanical Engineering, Maribor, Slovenia

## ABSTRACT

Manufacturing is currently at a turning point from mass production to customized production. The implementation of the Industry 4.0 concept, leading to automation and digitalization of manufacturing processes, is therefore considered vital for companies that aim to follow emerging trends in production. Research in this field is primarily focused on companies from developed countries, while companies from transition countries have difficulties to adapt to new business environment. The aim of this paper is to evaluate the use of advanced digital technologies in manufacturing companies from transition countries (i.e. Serbia) in the context of Industry 4.0. To address this problem, an evaluation method based on Fuzzy Analytic Hierarchy Process (FAHP) and Preference Ranking Organization Method for Enrichment Evaluations (PROMETHEE) is proposed. FAHP was used to determine criteria weights as an input for PROMETHEE method which was then used to evaluate advanced digital technologies. For this purpose, the dataset from the European Manufacturing Survey gathered in 2018 from Serbian manufacturing companies is used. The results of this empirical research revealed that production planning and scheduling, digital exchange of data with suppliers/customers, and production control systems play vital role for manufacturers in the context of industry 4.0. These results could serve to manufacturers for their strategic orientation and decision making.

© 2019 CPE, University of Maribor. All rights reserved.

## ARTICLE INFO

### Keywords:

Industry 4.0;  
Manufacturing;  
Digitalization;  
Advanced technologies;  
Multi-attribute decision making (MADM);  
Fuzzy analytic hierarchy process (FAHP);  
PROMETHEE method

\*Corresponding author:  
[medic.nenad@uns.ac.rs](mailto:medic.nenad@uns.ac.rs)  
(Medić, N.)

### Article history:

Received 10 May 2018  
Revised 12 December 2019  
Accepted 15 December 2019

## References

- [1] Lasi, H., Fettke, P., Kemper, H.-G., Feld, T., Hoffmann, M. (2014). Industry 4.0, *Business & Information Systems Engineering*, Vol. 6, No. 4, 239-242, doi: [10.1007/s12599-014-0334-4](https://doi.org/10.1007/s12599-014-0334-4).
- [2] Wang, S., Wan, J., Li, D., Zhang, C. (2016). Implementing smart factory of Industrie 4.0: An outlook, *International Journal of Distributed Sensor Networks*, Vol. 12, No. 1, 1-10, doi: [10.1155/2016/3159805](https://doi.org/10.1155/2016/3159805).
- [3] Kagermann, H., Wahlster, W., Helbig, J. (2013). *Recommendations for implementing the strategic initiative Industrie 4.0: Securing the future of German manufacturing industry, Final Report of the Industrie 4.0 Working Group*, Acatech – National Academy of Science and Engineering, Frankfurt, Germany.
- [4] Droege, H., Hildebrand, D., Forcada, M.A.H. (2009). Innovation in services: Present findings, and future pathways, *Journal of Service Management*, Vol. 20, No. 2, 131-155, doi: [10.1108/09564230910952744](https://doi.org/10.1108/09564230910952744).
- [5] Wang, S., Wan, J., Zhang, D., Li, D., Zhang, C. (2016). Towards smart factory for industry 4.0: A self-organized multi-agent system with big data based feedback and coordination, *Computer Networks*, Vol. 101, 158-168, doi: [10.1016/j.comnet.2015.12.017](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.comnet.2015.12.017).
- [6] Drath, R., Horch, A. (2014). Industrie 4.0: Hit or hype? [Industry Forum], *IEEE Industrial Electronics Magazine*, Vol. 8, No. 2, 56-58, doi: [10.1109/MIE.2014.2312079](https://doi.org/10.1109/MIE.2014.2312079).

- [7] Klöpffer, B., Pater, J.P., Dangelmaier, W. (2012). Parallel scheduling for evolving manufacturing systems, In: *Proceedings of 10th IEEE International Conference on Industrial Informatics (INDIN)*, Beijing, China, 1086-1091, [doi: 10.1109/INDIN.2012.6301356](https://doi.org/10.1109/INDIN.2012.6301356).
- [8] da Silva, V.L., Kovalski, J.L., Pagani, R.N. (2019). Technology transfer in the supply chain oriented to industry 4.0: A literature review, *Technology Analysis & Strategic Management*, Vol. 31, No. 5, 546-562, [doi: 10.1080/09537325.2018.1524135](https://doi.org/10.1080/09537325.2018.1524135).
- [9] Shafiq, S.I., Sanin, C., Szczerbicki, E., Toro, C. (2016). Virtual engineering factory: Creating experience base for Industry 4.0, *Cybernetics and Systems*, Vol. 47, No. 1-2, 32-47, [doi: 10.1080/01969722.2016.1128762](https://doi.org/10.1080/01969722.2016.1128762).
- [10] Tchoffa, D., Figay, N., Ghodous, P., Exposito, E., Kermad, L., Vosgien, T., El Mhamedi, A. (2016). Digital factory system for dynamic manufacturing network supporting networked collaborative product development, *Data & Knowledge Engineering*, Vol. 105, 130-154, [doi: 10.1016/j.datak.2016.02.004](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.datak.2016.02.004).
- [11] Turner, C.J., Hutabarat, W., Oyekan, J., Tiwari, A. (2016). Discrete event simulation and virtual reality use in industry: New opportunities and future trends, *IEEE Transactions on Human-Machine Systems*, Vol. 46, No. 6, 882-894, [doi: 10.1109/THMS.2016.2596099](https://doi.org/10.1109/THMS.2016.2596099).
- [12] Oesterreich, T.D., Teuteberg, F. (2016). Understanding the implications of digitisation and automation in the context of Industry 4.0: A triangulation approach and elements of a research agenda for the construction industry, *Computers in Industry*, Vol. 83, 121-139, [doi: 10.1016/j.compind.2016.09.006](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compind.2016.09.006).
- [13] Tzeng, G.-H., Huang, J.-J. (2011). *Multiple attribute decision making: Methods and applications*, 1st edition, Taylor & Francis Group, New York, USA, [doi: 10.1201/b11032](https://doi.org/10.1201/b11032).
- [14] Mardani, A., Jusoh, A., Nor, K.M.D., Khalifah, Z., Zakwan, N., Valipour, A. (2015). Multiple criteria decision-making techniques and their applications – A review of the literature from 2000 to 2014, *Economic Research – Ekonomika Istraživanja*, Vol. 28, No. 1, 516-571, [doi: 10.1080/1331677X.2015.1075139](https://doi.org/10.1080/1331677X.2015.1075139).
- [15] Mardani, A., Jusoh, A., Zavadskas, E.K. (2015). Fuzzy multiple criteria decision-making techniques and applications – Two decades review from 1994 to 2014, *Expert Systems with Applications*, Vol. 42, No. 8, 4126-4148, [doi: 10.1016/j.eswa.2015.01.003](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eswa.2015.01.003).
- [16] Medić, N., Marjanović, U., Zivlak, N., Anišić, Z., Lalić, B. (2018). Hybrid fuzzy MCDM method for selection of organizational innovations in manufacturing companies, In: *Proceedings of 2018 IEEE International Symposium on Innovation and Entrepreneurship (TEMS-ISIE)*, Beijing, China, 1-8, [doi: 10.1109/TEMS-ISIE.2018.8478445](https://doi.org/10.1109/TEMS-ISIE.2018.8478445).
- [17] Kubler, S., Robert, J., Derigent, W., Voisin, A., Le Traon, Y. (2016). A state-of-the-art survey & testbed of fuzzy AHP (FAHP) applications, *Expert Systems with Applications*, Vol. 65, 398-422, [doi: 10.1016/j.eswa.2016.08.064](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eswa.2016.08.064).
- [18] Behzadian, M., Kazemzadeh, R.B., Albadvi, A., Aghdasi, M. (2010). PROMETHEE: A comprehensive literature review on methodologies and applications, *European Journal of Operational Research*, Vol. 200, No. 1, 198-215, [doi: 10.1016/j.ejor.2009.01.021](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ejor.2009.01.021).
- [19] Macharis, C., Springael, J., De Brucker, K., Verbeke, A. (2004). PROMETHEE and AHP: The design of operational synergies in multicriteria analysis: Strengthening PROMETHEE with ideas of AHP, *European Journal of Operational Research*, Vol. 153, No. 2, 307-317, [doi: 10.1016/S0377-2217\(03\)00153-X](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0377-2217(03)00153-X).
- [20] van Laarhoven, P.J.M., Pedrycz, W. (1983). A fuzzy extension of Saaty's priority theory, *Fuzzy Sets and Systems*, Vol. 11, No. 1-3, 229-241, [doi: 10.1016/S0165-0114\(83\)80082-7](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0165-0114(83)80082-7).
- [21] Saaty, T.L. (1980). *The Analytic Hierarchy Process*, McGraw-Hill, New York, USA.
- [22] Kumar, A., Mussada, E.K., Ashif, M., Tyagi, D., Srivastava, A.K. (2017). Fuzzy Delphi and hybrid AH-MATEL integration for monitoring of paint utilization, *Advances in Production Engineering & Management*, Vol. 12, No. 1, 41-50, [doi: 10.14743/apem2017.1.238](https://doi.org/10.14743/apem2017.1.238).
- [23] Zimmermann, H.-J. (1985). *Fuzzy set theory – and its application*, Springer Science Business, New York, USA, [doi: 10.1007/978-94-015-7153-1](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-94-015-7153-1).
- [24] Taha, Z., Rostam, S. (2011). A fuzzy AHP-ANN-based decision support system for machine tool selection in a flexible manufacturing cell, *The International Journal of Advanced Manufacturing Technology*, Vol. 57, No. 5-8, 719-733, [doi: 10.1007/s00170-011-3323-5](https://doi.org/10.1007/s00170-011-3323-5).
- [25] Patil, S.K., Kant, R. (2014). A hybrid approach based on fuzzy DEMATEL and FMCDM to predict success of knowledge management adoption in supply chain, *Applied Soft Computing*, Vol. 18, 126-135, [doi: 10.1016/j.asoc.2014.01.027](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.asoc.2014.01.027).
- [26] Anojkumar, L., Ilangkumaran, M., Sasirekha, V. (2014). Comparative analysis of MCDM methods for pipe material selection in sugar industry, *Expert Systems with Applications*, Vol. 41, No. 6, 2964-2980, [doi: 10.1016/j.eswa.2013.10.028](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.eswa.2013.10.028).
- [27] Yager, R.R. (1981). A procedure for ordering fuzzy subsets of the unit interval, *Information Sciences*, Vol. 24, No. 2, 143-161, [doi: 10.1016/0020-0255\(81\)90017-7](https://doi.org/10.1016/0020-0255(81)90017-7).
- [28] Brans, J.P. (1982). L'ingénierie de la décision: élaboration d'instruments d'aide à la décision. La méthode PROMETHEE. In: Nadeau, M., Landry R. (eds.), *Laide a la Decision: Nature, Instrument set Perspectives*, Presses de l'Université Laval, Quebec, Canada, 183-214.
- [29] Lalić, B., Medić, N., Deliћ, M., Tasić, N., Marjanović, U. (2017). Open innovation in developing regions: An empirical analysis across manufacturing companies, *International Journal of Industrial Engineering and Management*, Vol. 8, No. 3, 111-120.
- [30] Marjanovic, U., Lalic, B., Majstorovic, V., Medic, N., Prester, J., Palcic, I. (2018). How to increase share of product-related services in revenue? Strategy towards servitization, In: Moon, I., Lee, G., Park, J., Kiritsis, D., von Cieminski, G. (eds.), *Advances in Production Management Systems. Smart Manufacturing for Industry 4.0. APMS 2018. IFIP Advances in Information and Communication Technology*, Vol. 536. Springer, Cham, Switzerland, 57-64, [doi: 10.1007/978-3-319-99707-0\\_8](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-99707-0_8).

- [31] Koren, R., Prester, J., Buchmeister, B., Palčič, I. (2016). Do organisational innovations have impact on launching new products on the market?, *Strojniški Vestnik – Journal of Mechanical Engineering*, Vol. 62, No. 6, 389-397, doi: [10.5545/sv-jme.2016.3470](https://doi.org/10.5545/sv-jme.2016.3470).
- [32] Koren, R., Palčič, I. (2015). The impact of technical and organisational innovation concepts on product characteristics, *Advances in Production Engineering & Management*, Vol. 10, No. 1, 27-39, doi: [10.14743/apem.2015.1.190](https://doi.org/10.14743/apem.2015.1.190).
- [33] Haddara, M., Elragal, A. (2015). The readiness of ERP systems for the factory of the future, *Procedia Computer Science*, Vol. 64, 721-728, doi: [10.1016/j.procs.2015.08.598](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.procs.2015.08.598).
- [34] Sajko, N., Kovacic, S., Balic, J. (2013). Simulation based CAD/CAM model for extrusion tools, *Advances in Production Engineering & Management*, Vol. 8, No. 1, 33-40, doi: [10.14743/apem2013.1.151](https://doi.org/10.14743/apem2013.1.151).
- [35] Zhou, K., Liu, T., Zhou, L. (2015). Industry 4.0: Towards future industrial opportunities and challenges, In: *Proceedings of 12th International Conference on Fuzzy Systems and Knowledge Discovery (FSKD 2015)*, Zhangjiajie, China, 2147-2152, doi: [10.1109/FSKD.2015.7382284](https://doi.org/10.1109/FSKD.2015.7382284).