

A closed loop Stackelberg game in multi-product supply chain considering information security: A case study

Babaeinesami, A.^a, Tohidi, H.^{b,*}, Seydaliakbar, S.M.^c

^{a,b,c}Department of Industrial Engineering, South Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

ABSTRACT

Realization of information security among supply chain components has always been one of the concerns of supply chain players. This research is the development of a mixed integer mathematical model for solving the problem of designing a multi-product network chain and balancing the separation line of parts in a closed loop supply chain. This model is responsive to market demand for finished products and spare parts simultaneously, and minimizes the transportation costs in forward and backward chains, product purchase costs in assembly section, costs of renewing collected products, and fixed costs of workplaces for the dividing the parts. This game consists of two players: the first player includes: Suppliers, assembly centers, retailers and customers, and the second player includes collection centers, renovation centers, separation centers and disposal centers. The payoff of each actor is minimizing their own objectives, and the objective of the model is the unawareness of the members of the chain from the objectives of other members (information security). The proposed model was solved in GAMS 24 software. Due to the nested model, the first model is solved first and the results of the model are entered into the second model. The results of the model solution show the good performance of the proposed model after implementation for the case study. Among the innovations of this research is the consideration of the Stackelberg game in multi-product closed loop supply chain along with the balance of the separation line of parts with the objective of minimizing all the cost elements.

© 2020 CPE, University of Maribor. All rights reserved.

ARTICLE INFO

Keywords:

Supply chain optimization;
Multi-product supply chain;
Closed-loop supply chain;
Game theory;
Stackelberg game;
Information security;
Renovation of products;
Collection of products

*Corresponding author:

H_tohidi@azad.ac.ir
(Tohidi, H.)

Article history:

Received 8 May 2019
Revised 7 March 2020
Accepted 17 March 2020

References

- [1] Li, J., Wang, Z., Jiang, B., Kim, T. (2017). Coordination strategies in a three-echelon reverse supply chain for economic and social benefit, *Applied Mathematical Modelling*, Vol. 49, 599-611, [doi: 10.1016/j.apm.2017.04.031](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apm.2017.04.031).
- [2] Kim, J., Chung, B.D., Kang, Y., Jeong, B. (2018). Robust optimization model for closed-loop supply chain planning under reverse logistics flow and demand uncertainty, *Journal of Cleaner Production*, Vol. 196, 1314-1328, [doi: 10.1016/j.jclepro.2018.06.157](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2018.06.157).
- [3] Flygansvær, B., Dahlstrom, R., Nygaard, A. (2018). Exploring the pursuit of sustainability in reverse supply chains for electronics, *Journal of Cleaner Production*, Vol. 189, 472-484, [doi: 10.1016/j.jclepro.2018.04.014](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2018.04.014).
- [4] Heydari, J., Govindan, K., Sadeghi, R. (2018). Reverse supply chain coordination under stochastic remanufacturing capacity, *International Journal of Production Economics*, Vol. 202, 1-11, [doi: 10.1016/j.ijpe.2018.04.024](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijpe.2018.04.024).
- [5] Phuc, P.N.K., Yu, V.F., Tsao, Y.-C. (2017). Optimizing fuzzy reverse supply chain for end-of-life vehicles, *Computers & Industrial Engineering*, Vol. 113, 757-765, [doi: 10.1016/j.cie.2016.11.007](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cie.2016.11.007).
- [6] Shi, J., Zhou, J., Zhu, Q. (2019). Barriers of a closed-loop cartridge remanufacturing supply chain for urban waste recovery governance in China, *Journal of Cleaner Production*, Vol. 212, 1544-1553, [doi: 10.1016/j.jclepro.2018.12.114](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2018.12.114).

- [7] Zailani, S., Iranmanesh, M., Foroughi, B., Kim, K., Hyun, S.S. (2019). Effects of supply chain practices, integration and closed-loop supply chain activities on cost-containment of biodiesel, *Review of Managerial Science*, 1-21, [doi: 10.1007/s11846-019-00332-9](https://doi.org/10.1007/s11846-019-00332-9).
- [8] Saedinia, R., Vahdani, B., Etebari, F., Nadjafi, B.A. (2019). Robust gasoline closed loop supply chain design with redistricting, service sharing and intra-district service transfer, *Transportation Research Part E: Logistics and Transportation Review*, Vol. 123, 121-141, [doi: 10.1016/j.tre.2019.01.015](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tre.2019.01.015).
- [9] Zhang, Z.-C., Guo, L., Wu, Q.-Q., Gong, L.-M., Ni, T.-T., Guo, P.-H. (2019). Dynamic pricing with reference quality effects in closed-loop supply chain, In: Huang, G., Chien, C.F., Dou, R. (eds), *Proceeding of the 24th International Conference on Industrial Engineering and Engineering Management*, Springer, Singapore, 549-557, [doi: 10.1007/978-981-13-3402-3_58](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-981-13-3402-3_58).
- [10] Kalverkamp, M., Young, S.B. (2019). In support of open-loop supply chains: Expanding the scope of environmental sustainability in reverse supply chains, *Journal of Cleaner Production*, Vol. 214, 573-582, [doi: 10.1016/j.jclepro.2019.01.006](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2019.01.006).
- [11] Guo, J., He, L., Gen, M. (2019). Optimal strategies for the closed-loop supply chain with the consideration of supply disruption and subsidy policy, *Computers & Industrial Engineering*, Vol. 128, 886-893, [doi: 10.1016/j.cie.2018.10.029](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cie.2018.10.029).
- [12] Jia, F., Gong, Y., Brown, S. (2019). Multi-tier sustainable supply chain management: The role of supply chain leadership, *International Journal of Production Economics*, Vol. 2017, 44-63, [doi: 10.1016/j.ijpe.2018.07.022](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijpe.2018.07.022).
- [13] Sahebjamnia, N., Fathollahi-Fard, A.M., Hajiaghahi-Keshteli, M. (2018). Sustainable tire closed-loop supply chain network design: Hybrid metaheuristic algorithms for large-scale networks, *Journal of Cleaner Production*, Vol. 196, 273-296, [doi: 10.1016/j.jclepro.2018.05.245](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2018.05.245).
- [14] Pereira, M.M., Machado, R.L., Ignacio Pires, S.R., Pereira Dantas, M.J., Zaluski, P.R., Frazzon, E.M. (2018). Forecasting scrap tires returns in closed-loop supply chains in Brazil, *Journal of Cleaner Production*, Vol. 188, 741-750, [doi: 10.1016/j.jclepro.2018.04.026](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2018.04.026).
- [15] Bhattacharya, R., Kaur, A., Amit, R.K. (2018). Price optimization of multi-stage remanufacturing in a closed loop supply chain, *Journal of Cleaner Production*, Vol. 186, 943-962, [doi: 10.1016/j.jclepro.2018.02.222](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2018.02.222).
- [16] Gu, X., Ieromonachou, P., Zhou, L., Tseng, M.-L. (2018). Developing pricing strategy to optimise total profits in an electric vehicle battery closed loop supply chain, *Journal of Cleaner Production*, Vol. 203, 376-385, [doi: 10.1016/j.jclepro.2018.08.209](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2018.08.209).
- [17] Hajipour, V., Tavana, M., Di Caprio, D., Akhgar, M., Jabbari, Y. (2019). An optimization model for traceable closed-loop supply chain networks, *Applied Mathematical Modelling*, Vol. 71, 673-699, [doi: 10.1016/j.apm.2019.03.007](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apm.2019.03.007).
- [18] Hasanov, P., Jaber, M.Y., Tahirov, N. (2019). Four-level closed loop supply chain with remanufacturing, *Applied Mathematical Modelling*, Vol. 66, 141-155, [doi: 10.1016/j.apm.2018.08.036](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apm.2018.08.036).
- [19] Ruiz-Torres, A.J., Mahmoodi, F., Ohmori, S. (2019). Joint determination of supplier capacity and returner incentives in a closed-loop supply chain, *Journal of Cleaner Production*, Vol. 215, 1351-1361, [doi: 10.1016/j.jclepro.2019.01.146](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jclepro.2019.01.146).
- [20] As'ad, R., Hariga, M., Alkhatib, O. (2019). Two stage closed loop supply chain models under consignment stock agreement and different procurement strategies, *Applied Mathematical Modelling*, Vol. 65, 164-186, [doi: 10.1016/j.apm.2018.08.007](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apm.2018.08.007).
- [21] Yu, W., Hou, G., Xia, P., Li, J. (2019). Supply chain joint inventory management and cost optimization based on ant colony algorithm and fuzzy model, *Tehnički Vjesnik – Technical Gazette*, Vol. 26, No. 6, 1729-1737, [doi: 10.17559/TV-20190805123158](https://doi.org/10.17559/TV-20190805123158).
- [22] Oršič, J., Rosi, B., Jereb, B. (2019). Measuring sustainable performance among logistic service providers in supply chains, *Tehnički Vjesnik – Technical Gazette*, Vol. 26, No. 5, 1478-1485, [doi: 10.17559/TV-20180607112607](https://doi.org/10.17559/TV-20180607112607).
- [23] Liang, Y., Qiao, P.L., Luo, Z.Y., Song, L.L. (2016). Constrained stochastic joint replenishment problem with option contracts in spare parts remanufacturing supply chain, *International Journal of Simulation Modelling*, Vol. 15, No. 3, 553-565, [doi: 10.2507/IJSIMM15\(3\)CO13](https://doi.org/10.2507/IJSIMM15(3)CO13).

Stackelbergova igra za krožno dobavno verigo z več izdelki glede na informacijsko varnost: Študija primera

Babaeinesami, A.^a, Tohidi, H.^{b,*}, Seyedaliakbar, S.M.^c

^{a,b,c}Department of Industrial Engineering, South Tehran Branch, Islamic Azad University, Tehran, Iran

POVZETEK

Uresničevanje informacijske varnosti med komponentami dobavne verige je bilo vedno eno od skrbi udeležencev v dobavni verigi. Ta raziskava opisuje razvoj mešanega celoštevilkega matematičnega modela za reševanje problema oblikovanja mrežne verige za več izdelkov in uravnoteženja ločevalne meje sestavnih delov v krožni dobavni verigi. Model se hkrati odziva na tržno povpraševanje po končnih izdelkih in rezervnih delih ter zmanjšuje stroške prevoza v prednjih in povratnih verigah, stroške nakupa izdelkov v montažnem delu, stroške obnove zbranih izdelkov in fiksne stroške delovnih mest za delitev sestavnih delov. Igra je sestavljena iz dveh igralcev: prvi igralec vključuje dobavitelje, montažne centre, prodajalce in kupce, drugi igralec pa zbirne centre, obnovitvene centre, ločevalne centre in odlagališča. Korist za vsakega člana se kaže v optimizaciji njegovih ciljev, cilj modela pa je, da člani verige ne poznajo ciljev drugih članov (informacijska varnost). Predlagani model je bil rešen v programski opremi GAMS 24. Zaradi ugnezdenega modela se najprej reši prvi model, rezultati modela pa se vnesejo v drugi model. Rezultati pridobljeni na podlagi študije primera kažejo dobro delovanje predlaganega modela. Med novostmi te raziskave je upoštevanje načel igre Stackelberg v krožni dobavni verigi z več izdelki, skupaj z uravnoteženjem ločevalne meje sestavnih delov, z namenom zmanjšanja vseh stroškovnih elementov.

© 2020 CPE, University of Maribor. All rights reserved.

PODATKI O ČLANKU

Ključne besede:

Optimizacija dobavne verige;
Dobavna veriga več izdelkov;
Krožna dobavna veriga;
Teorija iger;
Stackelbergova igra;
Informacijska varnost;
Prenova izdelkov;
Zbirka izdelkov

**Kontaktna oseba:*

H_tohidi@azad.ac.ir
(Tohidi, H.)

Zgodovina članka:

Prejet 8. maja 2019
Popravljen 7. marca 2020
Sprejet 17. marca 2020